

**NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**SCRUTINY OF HEALTH COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the meeting held at County Hall on 21 January 2011.

**PRESENT:-**

County Councillor Jim Clark (Chairman).

County Councillors:- Val Arnold, John Blackie, John Clark, Polly English, Andrew Goss, Margaret Hulme, Michael Knaggs, Shelagh Marshall, John McCartney, Heather Moorhouse, and Chris Pearson.

District Council Members: - Helen Firth (Craven), Ian Galloway (Harrogate) and Rob Johnson (Richmondshire) and Kay McSherry (substitute for Ruth Sayner Selby).

Officers: Bryon Hunter (Scrutiny Team Leader), Jane Wilkinson (Legal and Democratic Services).

Present by Invitation:

Yorkshire and the Humber Specialised Commissioning Group:- Pia Clinton-Tarestad, John Hancock and Bruce Willoughby

NHS North Yorkshire and York - Graham Purdy and Lorraine Naylor.

Yorkshire Ambulance Service - Vince Larvin .

Posterngate Surgery – Dr Reid and Jacqueline Roe.

Sandsend Surgery – Vicky Upton.

South Tees Hospital NHS Foundation Trust – Jill Moulton and Dr Buckley.

In attendance:-

Richmondshire District Council – Councillor Tony Duff. Tony Pelton

NY LINK – Kath Murray.

Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf of District Councillor Shirley Shepherd (Hambleton).

In attendance 8 members of the public.

---

---

**COPIES OF ALL DOCUMENTS CONSIDERED ARE IN THE MINUTE BOOK**

---

---

**62. MINUTES**

**RESOLVED -**

That the Minutes of the meeting held on 19 November 2010 be taken as read and be confirmed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

**63. CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

- Copies of the Action Log of Yorkshire Ambulance Service (North Yorkshire Performance Task & Finish Group) referred to in the Minutes of the previous meeting were tabled at the meeting and a copy placed in the Minute Book.

- Mental Health Services in North Yorkshire – Final determination of the new providers would be made by NHS North Yorkshire & York Primary Care Trust at their Board meeting on 25 January 2011.

**64. PUBLIC QUESTIONS OR STATEMENTS**

There were no questions or statements from Members of public concerning issues not on the agenda.

**RESOLVED –**

That those members of the public present at the meeting who wished to speak on items listed on the agenda would be invited to do so during consideration of the relevant item.

**65. APPLICATION TO MERGE SANDSEND & CHURCHFIELD GP PRACTICES (WHITBY) AND CLOSE A BRANCH SURGERY IN SLEIGHTS**

The Chairman announced that the following two items of business would be considered first for the convenience of Officers who were in attendance at the meeting.

**CONSIDERED –**

The report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Team Leader alerting the Committee to a proposal to merge Churchfield and Sandsend (both based in Whitby) practices and the subsequent closure of a branch surgery at Coach Road, Sleights, Whitby.

Appended to the report was a report from NHS North Yorkshire & York outlining:-

- thereasons for and background to the application.
- alternative local provision.
- stakeholder engagement and communication plan.
- timetable for closure.

The Committee was advised that 200 responses had been received from stakeholders, 98% of which supported the proposed changes. Only one family had indicated that they wanted to transfer to another practice. It was confirmed that local alternative practices had indicated they would be willingly to accept any patient transferees.

**RESOLVED –**

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee supports the merger of Sandsend and Churchfield GP Practices in Whitby under which the Coach Road branch surgery in Sleights will be closed and the surgery at Churchfield, Iburndale Lane, Sleights will become the main surgery, and the surgery at East Row a branch surgery.

**66. APPLICATION BY POSTERNGATE GP SURGERY, SELBY TO CLOSE BRANCH SURGERY PREMISES IN CAWOOD, SELBY**

**CONSIDERED –**

The report of the Scrutiny Team Leader inviting Members to comment on the results of public engagement on the proposal to close the Cawood branch surgery.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Lorraine Naylor, Assistant Director of Primary Care, NHS North Yorkshire and York presented the results of public engagement conducted between 25 October 2010 and 22 January 2011 (Appendix 2). She

advised the Committee that the main themes that had emerged from the feedback related to travelling/public transport arrangements, taking blood samples and the condition of the premises. With regard to bus services, she confirmed that bus timetables would be changed by Arriva in April and that at present she had no details of what the new arrangements would be. The search for alternative suitable premises from which to take blood samples in Cawood was continuing. A petition calling for the closure date of the branch surgery to be extended until the end of June 2012 so that alternative premises in Cawood could be located had been presented to Nigel Adams MP. A meeting with Nigel Adams MP had been arranged for the following week. Lorraine Naylor stressed that the practice had searched for the last ten years for suitable alternative premises in Cawood to no avail.

Members noted the concerns around public transport/access and taking blood samples and asked that all reasonable steps be taken to resolve these matters be taken before the branch surgery at Cawood was closed. Members supported the closure on the grounds of the condition of the premises and the findings of the infection control report.

#### **RESOLVED –**

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee supports the application by the Posterngate Practice to close branch surgery premises in Cawood and asks that before the premises are finally closed the Practice gives further consideration to public transport provision and locating suitable premises in Cawood from which blood services can be provided

### **67. YORKSHIRE AND HUMBER VASCULAR SERVICES REVIEW**

#### **CONSIDERED –**

The report of the Scrutiny Team Leader inviting the Committee to respond to the public consultation on proposed changes to vascular services across Yorkshire and the Humber which was currently underway.

The consultation was led by the Yorkshire and Humber Specialist Commissioning Group (SCG) on behalf of the fourteen Primary Care Trusts in the region.

A Review undertaken by SCG recommended reorganising specialist services in the region in order to improve patient care and safety. The preferred option recommended the centralisation of complex and emergency surgery with the establishment of four specialist centres, supported by a number of other hospitals working in partnership with the specialist centres.

The report was introduced by Pia Clinton-Tarestad, Assistant Director of Commissioning, Yorkshire and the Humber Specialist Commissioning Group. Pia Clinton-Tarestad explained why the changes were necessary and guided the Committee through the implications and risks for residents of North Yorkshire. She stressed that clinicians were fully supportive of the proposed changes and summarised engagement undertaken and feedback received. The closing date for responses to the consultation was 28 January 2011.

Members sought clarification of various aspects of the proposals on a question and answer basis.

Members supported in principle the proposed changes and commented as follows:-

- Appointment times - asked that careful consideration be given to appointment times for people living in the Craven area attending the specialist centre at Bradford. The distance and lack of public transport made it very difficult to

attend early morning appointments. If outpatient appointments and day cases were available locally it would help sustain smaller district general hospitals and make it easier for patients to receive support from their friends and relatives.

- Ambulance Service - Acknowledged the increased efficiency resulting from patients not being transferred from one hospital to another hospital after being stabilised but recognised the increased demand this would place on the ambulance service. Confirmation was sought that additional resource would be made available to plug any gap in funding that arose as a result of the changes being introduced.
- Craven area – patients requiring emergency surgery would on alternate weeks be taken to Huddersfield Hospital. Concern was expressed at the distance involved and that the ambulance would pass on its journey Airedale and Bradford Hospitals. The efficiency of this arrangement was queried.
- Boundary – commented that patient care and safety would be best served by the ambulance service taking emergency patients to the nearest specialist centre regardless of whether it was out of area.
- York Hospital – sought reassurance that every effort would be made to ensure that it retained its status as a centre for complex vascular procedures and that any developments in this regard were reported to the Committee.
- Scarborough surgeons – sought reassurance and confirmation that their skills would not be lost.
- Capacity – sought reassurance that the facilities at York and Hull Hospitals would be sufficiently improved so as to cope with increased patient numbers.

The Chairman invited Craven District Councillor Helen Firth to present the draft response of Craven District Council (Appendix 2 of the report) to the proposals. District Councillor Helen Firth highlighted the main points in the response. She said that Craven District Council supported in principle the proposed changes but had concerns about the selection of Huddersfield Hospital as centre for complex vascular procedures when it had not provided this service previously. Craven District Council also had concerns about the affect of the changes on the future sustainability of Airedale Hospital.

The Committee noted that the results of the consultation were due to be presented to the Board of the Yorkshire and Humber Specialised Commissioning Group in March 2011. If approved an implementation plan would be produced. The Scrutiny Team Leader requested that a copy of the implementation plan be forwarded to the Committee when available. This request was agreed by Pia Clinton-Tarestad.

On behalf of the Committee the Chairman thanked Pia Clinton-Tarestad for her attendance and the information she had provided. Members commended the work done by SCG for being comprehensive and its attention to detail.

#### **RESOLVED –**

That authority is delegated to the Chairman to submit on behalf of the Committee a written response to the consultation on vascular services in Yorkshire and the Humber that incorporates the comments made at the meeting.

#### **68. REDESIGN OF ACUTE STROKE CARE & TRANSFORMING TRAUMA & ORTHOPAEDIC SURGERY IN THE SOUTH TEES HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST – ENGAGEMENT PROCESS**

#### **CONSIDERED –**

The report of the Scrutiny Team Leader containing the final results of feedback from the public and patients on proposed revisions to trauma and orthopaedic surgery pathways.

The Chairman invited two Members of the public Mr Tony Pelton and Councillor Tony Duff to speak at this stage of the meeting.

Councillor Tony Duff expressed strong opposition to the changes in particular those relating to trauma and orthopaedic surgery. He said that the orthopaedic wards at Friarage Hospital had been closed. He quoted two examples of people being recently injured whilst in Richmondshire one of whom was taken by ambulance to Harrogate Hospital and the other to Darlington Hospital. He claimed that previously both would have been taken to Friarage Hospital. Instead they had suffered long and uncomfortable journeys as a result of the changes. He said that the new care pathways were reliant upon additional ambulance resource which was not available and that people were suffering as a result. He did not agree that the proposals would result in an improved service but were instead unnecessary centralisation.

Mr Tony Pelton read out a letter he had received from Simon Pleydell, Chief Executive, South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust dated 13 January 2010. The letter was in response to a letter he had sent about the consultation. Mr Pelton said he did not support the changes to stroke care pathways on the grounds that they would sideline the Friarage Hospital. Also for Richmondshire residents the increased distance to James Cook University Hospital was unsafe and it would be better if patients needing emergency care were sent to Darlington Hospital which was nearer and provided services on a 24/7 basis.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Jill Moulton, Director of Planning South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust summarised the background to the proposals, the results of public engagement and concerns raised during the engagement process.

The Committee noted that the changes to Trauma services had been implemented with effect from 4 January 2011. As a result of comments received during the engagement process trauma ambulance pathways had been modified and were due to come into effect on 24 January 2011.

Jill Moulton confirmed that arrangements for stroke services changes had been agreed as reported at previous meetings and that the Trust was working towards an implementation date of 1 April 2011. She stressed that no trauma beds at Friarage Hospital had been closed and that the orthopaedic ward remained open. Jill Moulton confirmed that South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust had built into its plans for Trauma Services the costs needed for additional ambulance provision. With regard to Stroke Services the changes were in line with national guidance and she said that responsibility for commissioning ambulance provision rested with the Primary Care Trust.

It was reported that negotiations around the provision of extra ambulance resource for stroke services were ongoing with a meeting of all parties scheduled for the following week. The suggested implementation date of 1 April 2011 was in doubt as the position surrounding provision of additional ambulance resource remained unclear. It was confirmed that the financial position of the Primary Care Trust meant that there was no new money available to provide additional ambulance resource.

Members repeated their support for the changes as expressed at previous meetings subject to additional ambulance resource being made available.

#### **RESOLVED –**

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee reaffirms its support to the proposals for Trauma and Orthopaedic surgery agreed originally at the meeting held on 19 November 2010 and notes that added ambulance service resource has been agreed. With regard to proposals to take all stroke patients to the hyperacute unit at

the James Cook University Hospital in Middlesbrough the Committee's support is conditional upon additional ambulance resource being put in place before the proposals for stroke services are implemented.

**69. OUT OF HOURS SERVICE IN RICHMOND AND CATTERICK**

CONSIDERED –

The report of the Scrutiny Team Leader on a motion forwarded to the Committee for debate by Richmondshire District Council on the Out of Hours Service in the Catterick area. The motion concerned changes to the overnight shift arrangement at Catterick Primary Care Centre and the impact of those changes on the night cover provided by GP's.

The Scrutiny Team Leader said that the issue was applicable to the whole of North Yorkshire and suggested a task group be established to investigate the matter further. Members supported this approach.

**RESOLVED –**

That a task group comprising of County Councillors Jim Clark, Polly English, John Blackie and Chris Pearson and District Councillor Rob Johnson be established to investigate the Out Of Hours Service in North Yorkshire and report back to a future meeting.

That Richmondshire District Council is notified accordingly.

**70. NHS CHANGES IN THE NHS: AN UPDATE.**

CONSIDERED –

The report of the Scrutiny Team Leader updating Members on recent developments following publication of the original White Paper, Equity and Excellence: Liberating the NHS in July.

**RESOLVED –**

That the report be noted.

**71. WORK PROGRAMME**

CONSIDERED –

The report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Team Leader inviting Members to comment on and approve the content of the Committee's future work programme.

The Scrutiny Team Leader suggested making the mid-cycle briefing meeting on 11 March 2011 an informal workshop open to all Members of the Committee. It was hoped that Jayne Brown, Chief Executive, NHS North Yorkshire & York would be able to attend the workshop to expand/take forward discussions held previously about the PCT's budget and service plans for 2011/12. Members welcomed the proposed event as an opportunity for the Committee to work proactively with the Primary Care Trust. The Scrutiny Team Leader said that once the arrangements had been finalised he would confirm the details to Members.

The Committee was advised that visits to wards at Whitby and Malton Hospitals (Hospital at Home Pilot in Malton and Whitby) would not be possible as the wards were now closed. The Primary Care Trust was in the process of analysing the results of the Hospital At Home Pilot (Whitby & Malton) and an interim report would

be considered at the April meeting. The Scrutiny Team Leader suggested that the June meeting of the Committee be held at a venue in Malton when the final report would be available. Copies of a poster created by the Ryedale District Group of the North Yorkshire LINK seeking feedback from patients who had recently been in hospital or in receipt of healthcare in their own home were tabled. The Scrutiny Team Leader advised that findings of the LINK would also be considered at the June meeting.

Concerns were raised regarding the waiting time for Podiatry treatment initially in Selby but following discussion across the whole of North Yorkshire. Members asked for it to be added to the Work Programme.

**RESOLVED –**

That the content of the Work Programme is approved subject to inclusion of items referred to in the Minutes being added.

JW/ALJ